

HIV Community Planning Council  
MEMBERSHIP COMMITTEE  
Thursday April 12, 2018  
25 Van Ness, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor Conference Room  
3:00-5:00 pm

---

**Committee Members Present:** Richard Bargetto (Co-Chair), Cesar Cadabes, Ed Chitty, Elaine Flores, Ron Hernandez, Ken Pearce (Co-Chair)

**Committee Members Absent:** Billie Cooper [A], Mick Robinson [LoA], Gwen Smith [A]

**Council Members Present:** Linda Walubengo

**Others Present:** Thomas Knoble, Beth Neary

**Support Staff Present:** Melina Clark, Dave Jordan, Mark Molnar

---

### *Minutes*

#### 1. Introductions

The meeting was called to order at 3:05 pm by Co-Chair Bargetto. Everyone introduced themselves and quorum was established.

#### 2. Review /Approve April 12<sup>th</sup>, 2018 DRAFT Agenda – VOTE

The April 12<sup>th</sup> 2018 DRAFT Agenda was reviewed and approved by consensus.

#### 3. Review /Approve March 8<sup>th</sup>, 2018 DRAFT Minutes – VOTE

The March 8<sup>th</sup> 2018 DRAFT Minutes were reviewed and approved by consensus.

#### 4. Announcements

- CS Molnar announced that the Steering Retreat is tomorrow, Friday, April 13<sup>th</sup> from 10am-4pm at the Women's Building.
- Beth Neary announced there's a HRSA Part C visit next month.

#### 5. Public Comment

- None.

#### 6. Co-Chair Election

- The committee discussed possible nominations for Membership Committee Co-Chairs.
- **MOTION: CM Bargetto moves to recommend CM Cadabes and CM Chitty as the Membership Committee Co-Chairs.**
- **Co-Chair Walubengo seconds the motion.**
- **VOTE: Motion Passes. See Column [1] for vote breakdown.**

#### 7. Demographic Information Update

- CS Jordan reviewed the monthly demographic report:
  - With Stacia's resignation, the Council is now slightly below 33% for Non-Aligned Consumers.
  - The biggest disparities in membership are still Latino/as, Native Americans and youth.
    - There are currently no consumers under the age of 45.

- There will be shifts with the resignation of Co-Chair Guzman and the addition of Thomas Knoble.
- There are a few people on the docket for membership. There will be further updates regarding this next month.

## 8. Renewal Process- VOTE

- The Committee reviewed the renewal process, including criteria for renewal.
- CS Molnar summarized the current renewal process.
  - The current renewal process includes an interview for each Council Member. This would be logistically very difficult. The recommendation is that there shouldn't be an interview process. However, there should still be some scrutiny.
  - This should be an easy process for everyone, without ignoring the fact that it's under the purview of Membership to engage with and address challenges that Council Members are having.
  - Today, the hope is to pass some kind of motion that would establish the membership renewal process as automatic renewal, except in rare cases where more scrutiny is required.
- CM Pearce noted that besides attendance, he doesn't see anything that would be easy to intervene with.
  - CS Molnar responded that Qualification # 3 under the Council Member Job Description could be grounds for review. It states "Commitment to adhere to the By-laws and policies and procedures of the Council"
    - For example, a person who says they don't believe in HIV Care services, that the Council has no right to prioritize services, or that integration between prevention and care are something we should be working against.
  - Co-Chair Walubengo noted that the Committee could address #3, but also try to get an understanding of why someone is behaving that way. It's important to invite conversation around why someone is thinking that way.
- CM Cadabes added that he wants to give folks the benefit of the doubt. The Council has already done the vetting for membership, so the focus should be on attendance.
- Co-Chair Walubengo added that everyone on the Council should have the same mission. If some folks do not understand the mission as a joint council, there needs to be discussion.
- CS Jordan noted that in comparing the Council to an Agency, in addition to the initial vetting, agencies usually do an annual reviews of employees. The process here could be similar. This is what the Care Council did in the past. While it would be logistically challenging to do this now, there should still be some kind of vetting.
- CM Flores expressed interest in learning about the mission behind bringing together Care and Prevention. She stated that Prevention and Care should be mutually respectful.
  - CS Molnar noted that if people are unaware of the mission, that's just a reason for Council Staff to check in with them about understanding. This wouldn't be qualification for automatic non-renewal, just about engaging with someone where they're at.
- CM Bargetto commented that attendance seems like a straightforward criteria for renewal. Muddling an invitation to clarify comments with the renewal process could be challenging.
  - CM Cadabes noted that the Council doesn't have mechanisms to measure and decide what's out of bounds. Inviting people in to clarify comments seems a little censoring.
  - CS Jordan added that the idea is not about different opinions on the Council, but rather folks who have voiced that they don't believe in the philosophy behind the Council, and trying to engage them.

- CS Molnar noted that calling people in on a rolling basis based on comments could be challenging. In order to engage people on when they are out of alignment with mission, there needs to be an objective structure. Renewal could be a great opportunity to do this.
- CM Chitty noted that he hasn't heard anyone say the Council shouldn't exist. Right now, attendance seems like the best measure so go on. He suggested continuing this conversation in the future.
- Co-Chair Walubengo noted that she has had conversations with someone who has varying beliefs about the mission of the Council. She is concerned with how to best support this person. With that insight, there are things that the Membership Committee needs to do. This conversation should continue in the future.
  - CM Cadabes expressed his support for talking about how to create a response that is supportive to Council Members.
- The Committee decided to put forth a motion surrounding attendance for now, and revisit this conversation in the future.
  - **MOTION: CM Chitty moves to approve the updated Membership Renewal Policy.**
    - Renewal will be determined by compliance with attendance requirements during the period of time prior to renewal.
  - **CM Flores seconds the motion.**
  - **VOTE: Motion Passes. See Column [1] for vote breakdown.**

#### 9. Council Member Attendance Report/ Council Applicants- VOTE

- Notice of Attendance to be sent:
  - Timothy Foster
  - Laura Thomas
- Notice of Attendance sent:
  - T.J. Lee
- Letters of Probation to be sent:
- Letters of Probation sent:
- Review Renewals:
  - Charles Adams
  - Jackson Bowman
  - Cesar Cadabes
  - Cicily Emerson
  - Elaine Flores
  - Matt Geltmaker
  - Bruce Ito
  - Lee Jewell
  - JP Soto
  - This conversation will be tabled until next month.
- Request for Leave of Absence:
- Current Leave(s) of Absence:
  - Mick Robinson (March-April)

- Charles Siron (March-April)
- Committee Assignments:
  - Wade Flores (Community Engagement → Membership)
  - Mike Shriver (Council Affairs → Community Engagement)
  - Linda Walubengo (Council Affairs → Membership)
  - **MOTION: CM Chitty moves to approve the changes in Committee Assignments for Wade Flores, Mike Shriver and Linda Walubengo.**
  - **Co-Chair Walubengo seconds the motion.**
  - **VOTE: Motion Passes. See Column [3] for vote breakdown.**
- Resignations/Thank You for Service to the Council:
- Review Exit Interview:
- Dismissal Letters to be sent due to attendance requirements:
- Review Prospective Member Application:
  - Jon-Edmond Abraham
    - CS Jordan noted that Jon Edmond-Abraham is a non-aligned consumer.
    - CS Molnar noted that Abraham has engaged with council in different ways. He has been to PLWH before as a fierce advocate for Long Term Survivors and seniors.
    - CM Pearce noted that Abraham didn't answer the questions on pages 5 or 6 of his application.
      - CM Cadabes expressed support for keeping a consistent membership process.
    - **MOTION: CM Cadabes moves to table this conversation until the Committee receives a more complete application as well as references.**
    - **CM Pearce seconds the motion.**
    - **VOTE: Motion Passes. See Column [4] for vote breakdown.**
- Interview/Discuss Prospective Applicant:
  - Thomas Knoble
  - Thomas has over 20 years of experience working in the field of HIV/AIDS. He was a member of the Prevention Council for 4 years. He is currently the Health Program Coordinator for CHEP, and is looking forward to the opportunity to serve as Government Co-Chair.
  - **MOTION: CM Cadabes moves to recommend Thomas Knoble as a Government Co-Chairs of the HCPC.**
  - **CM Chitty seconds the motion.**
  - **VOTE: Motion Passes. See Column [2] for vote breakdown.**
- Mentor Program

#### 10. Next Meeting Date & Agenda Items- VOTE

*The next Membership Committee Meeting is tentatively scheduled for Thursday, May 10<sup>th</sup> 2018, 25 Van Ness, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor Conference Room, SF CA from 3:00-5:00 pm.*

**Parking Lot:**

- Agencies the Council can collaborate with.

**11. Adjournment**

- The Meeting was adjourned at 4:03 pm by Co-Chair Bargetto.

**Membership Committee**

HIV Community Planning Council

Roll Call: **P**=Present; **A**=Absent; **E**=Excused; **L**=Leave of Absence

Votes: **Y**=Yes; **N**=No; **B**=Abstain; **R**=Recused (deduct from quorum)

**April 12, 2018**

roll [1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9]

1.	Richard Bargetto	P	Y	Y	Y	Y						
2.	Cesar Cadabes	P	Y	Y	Y	Y						
3.	Ed Chitty	E	Y	Y	Y	Y						
4.	Billie Cooper	A	-	-	-	-						
5.	Elaine Flores	P	Y	Y	Y	Y						
6.	Ron Hernandez	P	Y	Y	Y	N						
7.	Ken Pearce	P	Y	Y	Y	Y						
8.	Mick Robinson	L	-	-	-	-						
9.	Gwen Smith	A	-	-	-	-						
	Thomas Knoble											
	Ayes		7	7	7	7						
	Nayes											
	Total		7	7	7	7						